

THE RHETORIC FEATURES OF ENGLISH AND INDONESIAN ESSAYS MADE BY EFL UNDERGRADUATE STUDENTS

Teguh Budiharso

Universitas Mulawarman, Samarinda

Abstract: This study was aimed at analyzing the similarities and differences between English and Indonesian essays made by EFL undergraduate students. The problems rise from the transfer of first language (L1) cultural conventions to second language (L2) performance. Three rhetorical aspects: general patterns of thought (linear or non-linear), development of ideas, and coherence were compared and analyzed by using content analysis. The results of the analysis showed that EFL students devoted similar rhetoric features in writing English and Indonesian essays. The rhetoric similarity was shared in the use of linearity and non-linearity of ideas, the development of ideas in the whole essays as well as the coherence quality.

Key words: rhetoric, contrastive rhetoric, linearity, non-linearity, development of ideas, coherence

Rhetoric refers to the art of writing, including the practical skill of delivering a well-constructed theoretical science of formulating rules and conditions for good and balanced exposition (Wahab, 1986:88). It is a mode of thinking or finding all available means for the achievement of a desired end. Basically, it deals with what goes in the mind rather than what comes out of the mouth (Kaplan, 1980). In this study, rhetoric refers to how a writer produces ideas in an essay by logic, analytic wordings, and sentences. The current study focuses on analysis of the rhetoric features of English and Indonesian academic essays. Reviewing Kaplan's study (1966; 1987) on *Contrastive Rhetoric*, Connor (1996:100) posits that writing was concerned with the transfer of the first language (L1) cultural conventions to the second language (L2) performance. The transfer deals with the

rhetorical organization of ideas in writing that was assumed to be culturally determined. According to Kaplan, spoken language is primarily an innate, biologically determined ability; writing, on the other hand, is a “post-biological” step and obviously is not universal to all people. Because language and writing are cultural phenomena, the linguistic and rhetorical conventions of the L1 interfere with writing in the L2.

Various studies on writing indicate that as beginners, when students of ESL or EFL write in English, they translate or attempt to translate the L1 words, phrases, and organization into English. The students use patterns of language and stylistic conventions that they have learned in their native language and cultures (Connor, 1996:3-4). When they are mature to achieve successful accomplishments of the advanced level of mastery in writing, of course, they will not translate L1 words and patterns of L1 conventions into English anymore.

Although the subjects were assumed to have been equipped with formal, academic writing exercises (both in English and Indonesian), a considerable erroneous writings were found in the study. Specifically, this study attempted to compare how the rhetoric features of English and Indonesian essays made by EFL undergraduate students indicated similarities and differences. The rhetoric of English and Indonesian essays was evaluated on the basis of the task environment and the composing process. The rhetorical features in English and Indonesian essays made by EFL undergraduate students were compared and analyzed including their general patterns of thought (linear or non-linear), development of ideas, and coherence.

DATA COLLECTION

The data of this study were English essays and Indonesian essays. They were written by 10 EFL undergraduate students learning in the tenth semester of MUM. The participants were preparing to write a research report of an undergraduate thesis in English. Of the 10 participants, 7 came from class A and 3 from class B. As the policy of MUM, the students of class A achieved GPA 3.0 and up and students of class B achieved GPA 2.29 to 2.74.

The rhetoric of the English essay and the Indonesian essay was analyzed and evaluated on the basis of the task environment and the composing process (Connor, 1996:75). In the task environment, analysis was focused to see the writing topic, the audience, and the text product. In the writing processes, analysis was emphasized to see the process of planning and reviewing. Planning in-

involved generating ideas, goals, and procedures; and reviewing covered evaluating and revising. Specifically, this study used content analysis (Holsti, 1969:42-43) that aimed at analyzing the content of corpus of academic written discourse. Content analysis was appropriate in this study because it described the characteristics of content and made inferences about the causes of content and the effect of content. This technique was used to determine rhetoric features of the English and Indonesian essays that shared similar and different characteristics of the essays (Krippendorff, K, 1980; Miles and Huberman, 1994).

ANALYSIS

Linearity and Non-Linearity Essay¹

The linearity and non-linearity patterns of ideas of the present study are evaluated through the directness and indirectness thought patterns of an essay. Description is directed to answer the question: How do linearity and non-linearity ideas of the English essays and Indonesian essays made by the same EFL undergraduate students of MUM indicate similarities and differences? Evaluation of linearity and non-linearity is based on criteria modified from Wahab (1995b, 1995c), Sujoko (1999), and Harjanto (1999). Preceding the discussion on linearity and non-linearity ideas of the essay, characteristics of mode the students produced under study are presented.

As seen in Table 1 the dominant modes of writing under study are expository. Of the 10 English essays, 8 are expository and 2 are argumentative. In ad-

¹ Linearity of an essay was characterized mainly by the existence of an explicit thesis statement in the essay and clear supporting sentences that corresponded to the thesis (Wahab, 1995c). The thesis might appear in the introductory paragraph or in the closing paragraph. Each point of a thesis was described using examples, illustration, facts, statistics, citation, or a combination of each. Progression of topics was parallel and topics of successive sentences were the same. Linearity is the main character of good English paragraph. English rhetoric is colored with this linear pattern (Oshima and Hogue, 1991). While non-linear essay was characterized mainly with the absence of a thesis statement in the introductory paragraph. The non-linear essay might take one of the four types. First, ideas of a non-linear essay were not clearly defined and no relationship between one paragraph and other paragraphs appeared. Second, thesis statement appeared, but the thesis was introduced with irrelevant general statements. Third, progression of topics was sequential; topics of successive sentences were always different, as the comment of one sentence became the topic of the next. Fourth, progression of topics was extended parallel; the first and the last topics of a piece of text were the same but were interrupted with some sequential progression (Wahab, 1995c; Sujoko, 1999; Harjanto, 1999). Any essay using one or a combination of the four types of non-linear patterns used in this study is categorized a non-linear essay.

dition, of the 10 Indonesian essays, 8 are expository, 1 argumentative, and 1 descriptive.

Table 1. Modes of Essays under Study

Modes	English	Indonesian
1. Argumentative	2	1
2. Expository	8	8
3. Descriptive	-	1
Total	10	10

Though there are three different modes of writing, characteristics of presentation in the essay are not different. No matter what kind of mode is used in the essay: argumentative, expository, or descriptive, each presents a three-stage development, introduction, discussion, and conclusion.

In the introduction stage, one paragraph describing general statements is presented. Not all essays have a thesis in the introduction stage. In the discussion stage, body paragraphs are fulfilled providing details of information in the introduction. Variations of development in the discussion stage are obtained in reference to the linearity and non-linearity of ideas. In the closing stage, however, no single essay ends with a summary clarifying the thesis of the essay.

The argumentative essays do not begin with a controversial issue. Indication of the argumentative essay is simply asserted in the title of the essay. The expository and descriptive essays share similar techniques of presentation. The essays begin with the general statement as the background in the introductory paragraph, supported with illustration as the discussion in the body paragraphs, and ended with a paragraph that does not always clarify the thesis in the concluding paragraph. In all essays, details to support the topic are devoted to use individual's opinion. Facts, statistics, quotations, contrasts, or examples are not present in the essays.

Table 2 shows the results of analysis of the linearity and non-linearity patterns of ideas of English and Indonesian essays. An English essay and an Indonesian essay of the same writer were evaluated to see how pattern of ideas stated in an English essay had similarities and differences from the pattern of an Indonesian essay.

Table 2. Linearity and Non-Linearity Patterns of Ideas

Subject	Pattern of English Essays	Pattern of Indonesian Essay
1	Linear	Non-Linear
2	Linear	Linear
3	Linear	Non-Linear
4	Linear	Non-Linear
5	Linear	Linear
6	Non-Linear	Non-Linear
7	Non-Linear	Non-Linear
8	Non-Linear	Linear
9	Non-Linear	Non-Linear
10	Linear	Linear

Table 2 above describes that of 10 subjects writing English essays, 6 subjects shared linear patterns and 4 used non-linear ones. Of 6 subjects writing linear English essays, 3 devoted the linear Indonesian essays and 3 developed the non-linear ones. In addition, of 4 subjects writing non-linear English essays, 1 maintained a linear Indonesian essay and 3 asserted the non-linear ones.

The evidence of the linearity and non-linearity ideas in the above discussion indicates that thought patterns of the subjects under study were not necessarily parallel in an English essay and in an Indonesian essay. A writer using linear pattern in an English essay did not always produce a linear pattern when he or she wrote an Indonesian essay.

Supposedly, students writing the linear English essays also share linear Indonesian essays, because they had logic of similar goal. The evidence that a student writing linear Indonesian essay writes a non-linear English essay is interesting to note. A clarification is made in adherence to the competence in writing that relates to logic and context. The logic as the basic of rhetoric represents how a participant formulates his thought patterns. In this regard, the transfer of knowledge and conventions in L1 provides helps in organizing ideas in writing. In addition, context provides guides to put the appropriate style and mechanical aspects of writing.

To give more elaboration of the findings, linearity and non-linearity of the essays are described in the following section. Samples of excerpts are given for the basis of discussion.

Linear Essay

All of the 6 linear English essays were characterized by the use of introductory sentences as the general statement. The thesis statement was defined before a specific statement was clarified. All thesis statements of the linear essays were stated in the introductory paragraph. The following is an example of a linear English essay.

1a. Title: Problems in Developing English Thesis Proposal

Every student who studies in the university is required to finish a final assignment, i.e. a thesis. Unfortunately, arranging a thesis is not easy. Many problems are faced by students. These problems are advisor readiness, limited of literature in library, and difficulty of writing in English. (ING-2)

The above paragraph commences with general statements at the beginning and specifies its thesis statement at the end. The thesis statement (i.e. Many problems [that] are faced by students) is specified using three points of controlling ideas (i.e. These problems are advisor readiness, limited [of] literature in library, and difficulty of writing in English).

Ignoring the awkward and ungrammatical phrases or sentences (marked with [...] by the researcher) appearing in the paragraph, this excerpt shows characteristics of linear English essays under study. In the body paragraphs that follow, each point of the controlling ideas is developed. Each paragraph states a main idea that is subordinate to the thesis or theme.

However, at the end of the essay, the closing paragraph does not restate nor summarize the thesis statement. Described with additional comments and information, the concluding paragraph provides a conclusion different from what is stated in the thesis. The following is the concluding paragraph of script 1a.

1b. From the explanation above, we can conclude that problems in developing English thesis proposal are external and internal factors. So, the big problem is capability of English students to develop their ideas from their brain in written. Besides, trying hard is needed to develop their mind and they should not depend on

others. As a student of university, we should study hard and solve the problem by doing the best and trying hard. (ING-2)

In addition to the Indonesian essay, this study revealed that 4 of the linear Indonesian essays were characterized with the use of thesis statement in the introductory paragraph. The thesis statement was introduced with some points of general statement. The following excerpt supports the above description.

2a. Title: Tantangan Lulusan Bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM di Dunia Kerja.

Kita tahu bahwasanya tahun 2003 adalah tahun perdagangan global dimana negara kita akan bersaing dengan negara lain baik SDM nya SDA nya. Akankah kita berhasil jika manusia dalam negeri (Indonesia) lengah akan perubahan tersebut. Gambaran diatas adalah deskripsi umum yang dihadapi oleh semua lapisan masyarakat. Apalagi kita yang merupakan bagian kecil dari masyarakat yang katanya dipandang eksklusif yakni mahasiswa. Yang harus dihadapi oleh mahasiswa lulusan Bahasa Inggris banyak sekali. Tantangan-tantangan tersebut adalah masyarakat kita masih memandang bahwa lulusan PTN lebih baik dari PTS. Yang kedua ialah banyaknya mahasiswa lulusan bahasa Inggris. Ketiga anggapan atau respon masyarakat semua lulusan FKIP seharusnya jadi guru. (BIND-2)

Similar to the English essay in 1a and 1b, the linearity of essay 2a represents profiles of Indonesian essays under study. This essay is characterized by the use of some general statements in the beginning of the paragraph as background. At the end of the paragraph, a thesis statement and the controlling ideas are given. Awkward and ungrammatical phrases or sentences exist though they do not interfere with the message.

It is evident that the writer uses the same strategies to writing Indonesian and English essays. Using similar strategies to writing English essay, each point of the controlling ideas in Indonesian essays is developed in the body paragraphs. Admittedly, this paragraph also asserts something different from the thesis, providing a new comment and information irrelevant to the thesis. Moreover, neither does the closing restate nor summarizes the thesis. The closing paragraph of this essay looks like in excerpt 2b below.

2b. *Dan ketiga tantangan yang disampaikan oleh penulis, sebagai lulusan bahasa Inggris FKIP Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, jangan berkecil hati. Sebab mulai sekarang kita harus mempersiapkan diri untuk bersaing. Seseorang akan merasa "survive" jika mampu terseleksi oleh alam dan mampu bersaing sehat.*

Untuk itu kita harus benar-benar capable dan mempunyai skill yang tidak diragukan lagi. Disamping itu kita harus benar-benar menjadi mahasiswa yang bisa merubah pemikiran-pemikiran masyarakat yang keliru. Untuk meyakinkannya perlu usaha dari per individu lulusan bahasa Inggris FKIP dan membuktikan bahwa kita mampu bersaing dan bekerja secara profesional. Siapa lagi kalau bukan kita sendiri sebagai mahasiswa bahasa Inggris FKIP Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang. (BIND-2)

Non-Linear Essay

The same 10 subjects under study wrote 10 English essays and 10 Indonesian essays. The English essays consisted of 6 linear and 4 non-linear. The Indonesian essays comprised of 4 linear and 6 non-linear. In addition, of 4 subjects writing non-linear English essays, 3 of them wrote non-linear Indonesian essays; and of 6 subjects writing non-linear Indonesian essays, 3 developed linear English essays. Excerpts 3a and 3b below illustrate a non-linear English essay and a non-linear Indonesian essay written by a same writer.

3a. Title: Students' Motivation in Learning English

In this globalization era, a change of social-culture happens too fast and it is followed by the development of science and technology. Considering these phenomena, in education, the students should have a good skill and be able to enlarge their scope perception as the provisions their future. The students are demanded to have mental attitude and progress thinking, so that globalization and development of science and technology do not suppress them. (ING-9)

The above introductory paragraph discusses the importance of learning English in the globalization era. The writer develops his strategies into three stages. In the first sentence, the writer asserts the social change and its impact to science and technology. In the next sentence, the writer considers that education system should provide students to achieve a good skill. Finally, students are supposed to have mental attitude and progress thinking in addition to the development of science and technology.

Each sentence of the paragraph does not directly relate to each other, because it discusses a different topic. The writer does not state one specific topic or theme in the paragraph so that the topic is unfocused. As a result, the paragraph does not have a thesis or theme as a convention of a linear pattern of an academic essay.

In addition, the body paragraphs that support the above introductory paragraph discuss a lot of information and materials irrelevant to the topic. Controlling ideas and the related developments of the topic are not focused. The main and supporting ideas of the body paragraphs are not related to the theme. What is stated in the concluding paragraph is obviously something unfocused and unrelated to the topic of the essay. The concluding paragraph of the essay is quoted in 3b.

- 3b. As mentioned above that a success of the student in learning English followed by high motivation. Beside that, teacher's roles is also very important in their progress. So that, the research in elementary school as the first time they receive English subject interest to be investigated. Thereby, in this study the researcher is interest in conducting a research on the students' motivation in learning English. (ING-9)

As seen in excerpt 4a below, the writer indicates using similar strategies in developing ideas of Indonesian essay and English essay. The introductory paragraph in excerpt 4a begins with general statements as illustrations and background, but no specific topic or theme is introduced. Each point of the illustration of the paragraph provides a new comment and no controlling ideas are formulated.

4a. Title: *Persaingan Pencari Kerja*

Semakin hari kualitas pendidikan setiap perguruan tinggi semakin berlomba-lomba untuk ditingkatkan. Dari setiap tahunnya selalu mengadakan promosi besar-besaran agar mendapat peminat atau mahasiswa pendukung yang sebanyak-banyaknya. Tapi pada jaman sekarang ini apakah lulusannya sudah bermutu tinggi dimata pasaran kerja, karena kualitas kita yang dibutuhkan bukan mayoritas mahasiswa yang ada di jurusan. Banyak mahasiswa yang menguasai bahasa Inggris secara lisan maupun tulisan dan itu berarti banyak saingan yang harus kita hadapi nantinya dipasaran kerja. Ini merupakan satu tantangan yang tidak mungkin kita hindari untuk meraih sukses selain menjadi tenaga pendidik. Dan ada beberapa tantangan yang kita wajib siap untuk dipersiapkan, antara lain kemampuan kita sendiri, kualitas dari jurusan lain, mayoritas kebutuhan tenaga kerja di pasaran kerja ini. (BIND-9)

The concluding paragraph in 4b below supports the non-linearity pattern of script 4a. Giving three points: non-teacher vacancy, English proficiency of non-

English graduate, and a big number of competitors in the job market that are supposed to be the topics of the essay, the concluding paragraph seems to illustrate a summary of the introductory paragraph. As some main points of the summary are missing, however, the paragraph asserted a new information that is not directly related to the topic.

- 4b. *Memang banyak sekali tantangan dan permasalahan yang harus kita hadapi agar kita dapat nama di pasaran kerja selain guru. Dan yang pasti, kita sebagai mahasiswa bahasa Inggris kita harus bisa menunjukkan kemampuan kita dan dapat lebih bersaing dengan jurusan dan bahkan fakultas ataupun dengan perguruan tinggi lain.* (BIND-9)

Development of Ideas

The development of ideas is evaluated in parts of the essay level: introduction, body, and ending. Titles of the essays are discussed preceding the paragraph levels and the controlling ideas of the essays are described sequentially in the discussion. Description is directed to answer the question: How does the development of ideas organized in the English essays and Indonesian essays made by the same EFL undergraduate students of MUM indicate similarities and differences?

Title

Evaluation of a good title of academic writing under study is based on Oshima and Hogue's (1991:19) criteria. A good title tells the reader what the topic of an essay is. It should indicate the content of the essay. The title should be accurate, informative, and as comprehensive as possible. A good title is usually a word or phrase, not a sentence. It should be brief, but not so brief that it does not tell the reader what to expect.

All of the English and Indonesian essays under study have single titles, meeting the characteristics of titles of academic writing. The titles can be divided into two categories: definite and broad. Of 10 English essays, 7 served characteristics of definite titles and 3 asserted broad titles. The following are examples of titles of English essays, which are definitely formulated.

- 5a. Problems in Developing English Thesis Proposal (ING-1)
The Problems of Writing Thesis (ING-3)

Writing Problems Faced by Students of the English College of MUM (ING-4)
Writing Problems Faced by English Students in MUM (ING-5)
Thesis Proposal as a Problem in Composing a Thesis (ING-7)
Students' Motivation in Learning English (ING-9)

The examples show that the titles are informative and brief.

Besides providing what to expect the titles enable readers to predict the discussion of the essay, though the substance of the essay may not properly meet the expectation of an academic writing. The first elements of the titles above (e.g. Writing Problems, Thesis Proposal, Students' Motivation) describe the topic to be discussed in the essay. The second parts (e.g. Faced by English Students in MUM, as a Problem in Composing a Thesis, in Learning English) restrict the discussion of the subject matters.

Students wrote the definite titles without fully understanding of the topics, however. Being afraid of making mistakes in formulating appropriate titles, the students copied or modified topics in the writing prompts when they were writing the essays.

Three examples in script 5b show single titles that are broadly formulated. These titles deal with too general topics, so that the discussion to be presented cannot be predicted. As the titles indicate broad themes, the writers cannot give the clue of what to write.

5b. Students Problems in Writing English (ING-6)
The Problem in Writing (ING-8)
The Problem of Thesis (ING-10)

The students, because of two reasons, wrote the broad titles. The students were confused the content of the topic they should have developed. Besides, they tried to shorten the topics assigned to write by creating their own topics. The first parts of the titles in 5b have defined the specific topics to discuss, (e.g. Students Problems, The Problems); however, the second parts of the titles do not specify the point of discussion (e.g. Writing English, Writing, and Thesis).

Titles of the Indonesian essays are also identified with definite formulation and broad formulation. Of 10 essays, 4 serve definite titles and 6 share the broad titles. Similar to the titles of the English essays, the titles of the Indonesian essays also consist of two parts: theme and specific topic. The theme indicates the general idea of the essays and the specific topic refers to the limitation points fo-

cused to the discussion of the essay. Excerpt 6a describes the definite titles of the Indonesian essays.

- 6a. *Tantangan Lulusan Bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM di Pasaran Kerja* (BIND-1)
Tantangan Lulusan Bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM di Dunia Kerja (BIND-2)
Bagaimana Meningkatkan Mutu Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris di UMM (BIND-4)
Jurusan Bahasa Inggris Sebagai Bagian Dari Masyarakat Akademis (BIND-8)

The above examples show that the definite titles in 6a are informative and shortly phrased. The contents of the essay are easily predicted through the clues used in the phrases of the titles. Though the titles enable readers to predict the discussion of the essay, it does not mean that the essays substantially meet proper expectation of the academic writing.

Excerpt 6b below exemplifies the broad title of the Indonesian essays under study. Each of the titles has one general statement as the theme and another general statement as focus of discussion of the essay. The first part enables readers to find general points of what is discussed, but the second part is too general for the reader to predict points of discussion of the essay.

- 6b. *Jurusan Bahasa Inggris dan Tantangannya* (BIND-3)
Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Sudahkah? (BIND-5)
Guru Bahasa Inggris Masih Diperlukan? (BIND-6)
Masa Depan Guru Bahasa Inggris di Era Reformasi (BIND-7)
Tantangan Persaingan Pencari Kerja (BIND-9)
Tantangan Bagi Lulusan Bahasa Inggris (BIND-10)

Introductory Paragraph

Characteristics of a good introductory paragraph of an academic essay used in this study refer to criteria given by Kirsznar and Mandell (1978:64), Oshima and Hogue (1991:76), and Wingersky, Boerner, Holguin-Balogh (1992:221). The purpose of an introductory paragraph is to get the reader's attention and to let the reader know what will be covered in the essay. An introductory paragraph consists of two parts: a few general statements about the subject to attract the reader's attention and a thesis statement to state the specific subdivisions of the topic and the plan of the essay. The introduction introduces the subject matter of the essay and indicates through the controlling idea what will be discussed.

Based on the 10 English essays and 10 Indonesian essays obtained from the same subjects under study, two types of introduction are identified. The first type is a linear introduction that represents characteristics of direct presentation of ideas, and the second type is a non-linear introduction that indicates features of indirect presentation of ideas.

The linear introduction presents its ideas in terms of (1) general introductory sentence, (2) a definite theme to be described and (3) controlling ideas presented in terms of sentences. Three identifications characterize the non-linear introduction: (1) the general introductory sentences, (2) unclear or vague topics to be described, and (3) unclear or vague controlling ideas.

Most linear and non-linear introductions are presented in the same way: deductive to inductive reasoning. Indication is shown in that some general statements are presented as the background. The next sentences of the introduction illustrate several points related or unrelated to the statement. Finally, in the last part of the introductory paragraph, the writers do not declare specific theme and definite subject matters indicating a plan to be discussed in the essay. Script 7a exemplifies an introductory paragraph of a linear essay.

7a. Title: The Problems of Writing Thesis

Writing thesis is the last assignment that must be fulfilled by the students in order to graduate of one college. For example, in English Department of MUM, every student has to do this subject beginning in seventh semester under guidance lecturer. Although, they do it under guidance of lecturer, most of them still often find difficulties. Those difficulties are finding literary books, choosing a counselor, and developing English skill. (ING-3).

The introductory paragraph of 7a illustrates how general statements are developed into specific ones. The discussion starts from a deduction (i.e. Writing thesis is the last assignment that must be fulfilled by the students in order to graduate of one college) as the background of the theme to the induction process. Though the ideas are not well organized, the writer specifies his theme referring to the inductive process (i.e. Those difficulties are finding literary books, choosing an advisor, and developing English skills), inferring the thesis and controlling ideas of the essay.

Relying on excerpt 7b below, a description of a linear introduction of an introductory paragraph of an Indonesian essay is discussed.

- 7b. Title: Jurusan Bahasa Inggris Sebagai Bagian dari Masyarakat Akademis
Sebagai bagian dari perguruan tinggi, UMM jurusan bahasa Inggris dituntut untuk menempatkan dirinya menjadi masyarakat akademis. Yaitu masyarakat kampus yang secara dinamis mengembangkan bobot nilai-nilai akademisnya sehingga UMM mampu memberikan nilai beda yang positif dari jurusan-jurusan bahasa Inggris yang telah ada. Dan pada saatnya mampu menghasilkan alumni-alumni yang benar-benar handal.. (BIND-8)

The above paragraph shows how the development of ideas is presented. Unlike 7a, this paragraph represents inductive to deductive reasoning. The first part of the paragraph indicates a thesis statement or the topic of the essay. The next elements serve as comments of the thesis statement. The introductory paragraph meets the criteria of a linear introduction of an academic writing.

Unlike the linear introductory paragraph, script 7c and 7d illustrate examples of non-linear introductions of an English essay and an Indonesian essay. In script 7a, the non-linearity of an introduction can be observed from the development of ideas that jumps from one point to another. The paragraph is not focused on one topic and the sentences are not related to each other. Some awkward sentences and stringy sentences appear in this paragraph. Besides, the thesis statement does not appear in this paragraph and the controlling ideas are not defined, either. As a result, this paragraph does not meet the criteria of an academic writing.

- 7c. Title: Students Problems in Writing English
Every courses or universities, it is known that writing is one basic in learning English, because we are expected to master in English, even in speaking, reading, or writing itself. In Muhammadiyah University of Malang, those kinds of basic English are unlikely to be the particular purpose that are given to the students, especially at English Department. Here, we are going to discuss about those basic English, specialized in writing subject. In MUM writing subject is given from writing I up to IV. So far, many problems students have to write any kinds of paper in English, such as the lack of vocabulary, the ability in structuring English sentence, and the students ability in rearrange the English words. (ING-6)

Another example of a non-linear introductory paragraph of an Indonesian essay is quoted in 7d. The non-linearity of ideas in this paragraph is clearly observed from the progression of ideas that digresses from one point to a new dif-

ferent one. One sentence is the comment of the other sentences, so that no focus is achieved. Topic and controlling ideas are not stated in this paragraph.

- 7d. Title: Tantangan Lulusan Bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM di Pasaran Kerja
Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang mempunyai tujuan untuk mempersiapkan dan mencetak sarjana yang berkualitas di bidangnya. Salah satu fakultas yang ada di UMM adalah Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan (FKIP). FKIP Mempunyai empat jurusan dan satu diantaranya adalah jurusan Bahasa Inggris. Sesuai dengan namanya, mahasiswa di jurusan Bahasa Inggris dipersiapkan untuk menjadi seorang guru. Akan tetapi pada masa perkuliahan mahasiswa akan mendapatkan dua mata kuliah pilihan yaitu Translation dan Business English. Maksud dari adanya dua mata kuliah pilihan tersebut adalah untuk memberikan pengetahuan tambahan kepada mahasiswa selain mendapatkan pengetahuan tentang bagaimana menjadi seorang guru atau pendidik. (BIND-1)

Body Paragraph

The major function of the body paragraphs is to support the controlling idea of an essay. The body paragraphs provide reasons, examples, or arguments that clarify, expand, or develop its implications. The controlling idea of an essay usually gives little detailed information. The support paragraphs provide the depth of discussion that a well-developed essay needs (Kirsznner and Mandell, 1978:86). Each body paragraph has a topic sentence that states one aspect of the controlling idea. The detailed information in the body paragraphs enables readers to understand more clearly what the essay is trying to say. The following parts present analysis of the body paragraphs of linear and non-linear essays. Due to the lengthy sample analysis, description is divided separately into two sections.

Body Paragraph of Linear Essay

The body paragraphs of linear and non-linear essays under study show similar characteristics in that the progressions of ideas are digressive and that the topic of each paragraph and the controlling ideas are unfocused. Topic and controlling ideas in an introductory paragraph of a linear essay do not always appear in the supporting paragraphs. A paragraph in the body may have a topic sentence relevant to the thesis statement in the introductory paragraph, but the substance of the details in the paragraph deviates from the topic sentence. The body

paragraphs also present an additional paragraph irrelevant to the controlling ideas providing comments of the idea in the previous paragraphs. As a result, the body paragraphs are unfocused and unmatched to the topic of the essay. All body paragraphs on the linear English and Indonesian essays serve only illustration techniques that are based on personal interpretation to a topic for the reasoning. Statistics, arguments, facts, and examples are not used to provide reasons of the detailed descriptions.

Excerpt 8a below is the body paragraphs whose introductory paragraph is quoted in 7a, representing an example of a linear English essay. The purpose of quoting this body paragraph is to show how a topic and controlling ideas in the introductory paragraph are detailed in each body paragraph. In addition, the presence of a controlling idea that is used as the topic sentence in each paragraph of the body is also evaluated, as well as reasoning techniques to support the details of the body.

The title of the essay quoted in 7a is *The Problems of Writing a Thesis*. The thesis statement of 7a is introduced in the introductory paragraph. The thesis statement reads “writing a thesis as the final assignment at MUM” and the controlling ideas state an elaboration of problems on writing a thesis: “finding literary books, choosing an advisor, and developing English skills”. Using the thesis statement and the controlling ideas of this essay as an outline, a reader expects to find detailed information on problems on finding references, appropriate thesis advisors, and writing the thesis report, respectively. See 8a.

8a. Many books that related to the thesis are needed in composing thesis. Those books usually consist of such theories that can support the thesis in order be a responsible writing. In fact, the students often find difficulties to find those books when they begin to compose it. Because the library of their University does not provide many books specially research books. Whereas, finding to buy it is difficult and expensive.

A further problem is choosing guidance lectures. Although the Head of English Department has policy to determine the appropriate counselor due to the title of the thesis, the students often get inappropriate lecturer. It means that they do the thesis under the guide who does not comprehend deeply about the thesis that will be discussed. They automatically do it without any respond of their lecturer and do not have more time to consult about their thesis. In addition, they will put it off until tomorrow, until long time.

Other problem faced by the students is developing English skill in productive level specially writing. This problem makes students' thesis impeded. They often compose a thesis in ungrammatical sentences or using inappropriate words. In a result, they spend their time to meet their counselor to get correction of it and get much revision, even rewrite their writing. (ING-3)

Having a close look at quotation 8a, three conclusions are made. First, three points stated in the controlling ideas, i.e. problems on finding references, problems on having advisors, and problems on writing thesis in English are roughly stated in the first, second, and third of the whole body paragraphs. Second, implicitly each point of the controlling ideas of the essay has been developed as the topic sentence of each paragraph. Third, supporting sentences in each body paragraph substantially deviate from the topic, so that the body paragraphs do not have a unity. As a result, the lay out of this essay meets the criteria of academic writing, but not for the substance. The way the development of ideas in the body paragraphs deviates from the topic has the same characteristics as the non-linear essays, English or Indonesian essays.

In quotation 8b, an evaluation is delineated to show how the body paragraphs of an Indonesian essay support the thesis in the essay. The essay of 8b originates from an Indonesian essay entitled *Jurusan Bahasa Inggris Sebagai Bagian Dari Masyarakat Akademis*, the introductory paragraph of which is quoted in 7b.

A linear idea of this essay is achieved through the presence of its topic sentence: English Department of MUM as a member of an academic society (*Sebagai bagian dari perguruan tinggi, UMM Jurusan Bahasa Inggris dituntut untuk menempatkan dirinya menjadi masyarakat akademis*). The remaining of the paragraph is the description of academic society, used as the controlling ideas. Two points are stated in the controlling ideas: *English Department of MUM should increase its academic quality and produce qualified graduates*.

8b. Beberapa langkah yang perlu ditempuh antara lain:

Pertama, jurusan bahasa Inggris harus memberikan kurikulum pengajaran yang berbeda dari kurikulum pengajaran bahasa Inggris yang selama ini ada di perguruan tinggi lain. Perbedaannya terletak pada penekanan aspek keinggrisannya dengan jalan menyajikan Mata Kuliah Dasar Umum dengan bahasa Inggris. Sebagai contoh adalah matakuliah Dasar-dasar Psikologi, dasar-dasar Pendidikan, dan Ilmu Budaya Dasar. Cara semacam ini dilakukan untuk memberikan nuansa akademis bahasa Inggris disamping untuk mengkaji khasanah ilmu pada

setiap mata kuliah tersebut. Dengan demikian mahasiswa akan lebih terbiasa terlibat dalam kondisi berbahasa Inggris.

Kedua, jurusan bahasa Inggris terus bisa memberikan kesempatan mahasiswa berlatih memakai bahasa yang dipelajari seoptimal mungkin. Langkah ini dianggap penting dan mendesak, mengingat bahwa penguasaan ketrampilan berbahasa akan sulit dicapai manakala sebagai learners kurang aktif menggunakan kesempatan berlatih memakai bahasa, baik dalam bentuk tulisan maupun lisan. Keharusan berlatih ini akan semakin lebih penting lagi bila dikaitkan dengan pendekatan pengajaran yang ditempuh di jurusan bahasa Inggris UMM yaitu, *learning how to use, not learning how to know*, yang berarti belajar dengan lebih mengutamakan menggunakan bahasa yang dipelajari secara langsung ketimbang belajar bahasa hanya sekedar ingin mengetahui bentuk-bentuk bahasa. Keberadaan kegiatan yang menunjang seperti *English Day, Student Day, Progressio* dan lainnya harus dimanfaatkan sebaik mungkin.

Ketiga, jurusan bahasa Inggris juga harus dan perlu membangun hubungan akademis yang harmonis antar civitas akademika. Suasana belajar yang makin semarak akan benar-benar terjadi manakala dosen dan mahasiswa berada dalam satu misi, persepsi, dan orientasi. Untuk itu, para dosen dan mahasiswa jurusan bahasa Inggris perlu mengadakan kesepakatan untuk menyamakan pandangan bahwa "mahasiswa adalah milik dosen, demikian pula sebaliknya, dosen adalah milik mahasiswa." Sehingga rasa saling memiliki (*sense of belonging*) dari semua civitas akademika jurusan bahasa Inggris akan terus mengalir dan akhirnya bermuara pada terbentuknya hubungan yang berkekeluargaan.. (BIND-8)

Considering the introductory paragraph in 7b and the body paragraphs in 8a, the reader expects that in the first body paragraph, the writer shall immediately describe strategies how the English Department of MUM increases its teaching quality. In addition, the description of how MUM produces qualified English graduates is subject to be illustrated in the following paragraph. Both ideas have existed in the body; however, the writer adds one more paragraph as a comment of the remaining two paragraphs. Consequently, the body paragraphs digress from the topic of the essay. In short, analysis to the body paragraphs in 8a and 8b shows a similarity in that the body paragraphs of the linear essay are unfocused and deviate from the topic of the essay. The patterns of development of ideas similarly appear in both linear English and Indonesian essays.

Body Paragraph of Non-Linear Essays

Characteristics of the body paragraphs of non-linear essays are similar to the linear essays. The body paragraphs of this essay provide reasons using personal analysis to develop and support the details of the paragraphs. Similar to the linear essays--English or Indonesian--the body paragraphs of non-linear essays may have a vague thesis but have no related points to discuss as a whole in one paragraph. Additional comments irrelevant to the topic may also appear in a single paragraph within the body. Different from the body paragraphs of linear-essays that always have a topic sentence, the body paragraphs of non-linear essays do not have either topic or controlling ideas. In other words, the body paragraphs of non-linear essays are unrelated, as each sentence in the supporting details does not match to each other; one becomes the comment of the other. The body paragraphs fail to clarify or expand the topic, because the details deviate and are unfocused.

Sample body paragraphs of non-linear English and Indonesian essays are presented in 8c and 8d. For convenience, the whole English and Indonesian essays are completely quoted.

Quotation 8c clearly indicates the progression of ideas that digresses. No thesis statement is defined in the introductory paragraph of this essay; whereas the supporting sentences in the paragraph provide comments to the previous sentences. The introductory paragraph is unfocused and the controlling ideas are unrelated to each other. Moreover, the body paragraphs present irrelevant ideas that do not match to each other. Some points of some sentences of the body paragraphs are the repetitions of ideas in the previous sentences.

8c. Title: Thesis Proposal as a Problem in Composing a Thesis

Introductory Paragraph The students have to compose a thesis as a stipulation to graduate from college. Before conducting the research, the students must prepare the proposal. Preparing their proposal is the main process in composing thesis. Much of the students got difficulties in developing thesis proposal such as to choose the problem statement, to collect the suitable reference, and to plan the research methodology. Before composing a thesis, we must have some problems that must be solid in methodology. And they must know the reason having that problem. At least he or she must have certain objective in conducting that research. The problem is the student does not understand their background of their problem. So that they must know and understand the background and their objective in their thesis.

Body Paragraphs The other problem is when the researcher must compose several theories or references in their thesis. Because of their limitation in reading books or other information media, they got difficulties to found the suitable theories to their problem statement.

And the students difficult to chosen the right research methodology for their thesis. In this case, the student must use the suitable method: descriptive, exposdefacto, or narrative. Commonly they got difficulties in choosing the suitable one. And they also confuse to choose the sample or the instrument of research.

Concluding Paragraph At last, we know that the thesis proposal is the difficult problem in composing thesis. Therefore, to overcome that problem the students must have good preparation by reads, or learn from the beginner thesis. (ING-7)

In addition to the concluding paragraph, it is evident that the concluding paragraph does not summarize, nor restates the topic due to the absence of the thesis statement in the essay. In short, the concluding paragraph deviates from the topic, as the essay is not focused to a certain idea.

8d. Title: Jurusan bahasa Inggris dan Tantangannya

Introductory Paragraph *Hidup di dunia yang semakin mengglobal seseorang dituntut agar semakin pandai berkomunikasi. Tidak hanya berkomunikasi yang bersifat lokal. Akan tetapi bersifat internasional. Hal ini logis, mengingat mobilitas atau daya gerak manusia modern tidak lagi antar desa dan kota, tetapi akan lebih meluas dan merebak antar bangsa.*

Body Paragraphs *Disamping itu, kebutuhan seseorang tidak akan cukup dipenuhi dilingkungan atau di negaranya sendiri, sehingga mengharuskan mereka beranjak kenegara lain untuk memenuhinya. Kecenderungan (trend) semacam ini akan memungkinkan terbentuknya lapangan kerja baru di sebuah negara, termasuk Indonesia.*

Dalam suasana seperti di atas, seseorang mempunyai cukup ketrampilan berkomunikasi dengan Bahasa Inggris akan menjadi incaran para pemberi kerja (employers). Dengan kata lain, mereka yang bisa berbahasa Inggris akan mendapatkan kesempatan lebih ketimbang pencari kerja lainnya. Dalam hal ini, alumni jurusan Bahasa Inggris berpeluang besar dan harus semakin tertantang anggapan yang selama ini mengatakan, "alumni jurusan Bahasa Inggris hanya berpeluang menjadi guru". Perlu kiranya segera dipikir ulang, walaupun mungkin tidak boleh di buang.

Selain ketrampilan berkomunikasi dengan Bahasa Inggris, tantangan lain yang perlu diantisipasi adalah tuntutan untuk semakin profesional. Dalam artian bahwa seseorang harus benar-benar mumpuni dalam bidang yang telah ia pegang. Hanya mereka yang berpredikat profesional saja yang bisa betah hidup

dan berkembang. Sebaliknya, mereka yang kurang profesional akan semakin jauh terpental dan terbang.

Concluding Paragraph *Demikian sebagian dari tantangan yang perlu kita ketahui. Dengan menyadari adanya tantangan tadi, kita diharapkan bisa secara dini menyiapkan bekal agar tampil sebagai pemenang dalam pergumulan hidup yang lebih nyata. (BING-3)*

With regard to the Indonesian essay, the mismatch between topic and controlling ideas in the introductory paragraph, the body, and the concluding paragraphs is obvious. Essay 8d above shows how the development of ideas works.

Essay 8d consists of 5 paragraphs, one introductory paragraph, three body paragraphs, and one concluding paragraph. The introductory paragraph is too general, so that the theme and the controlling ideas cannot be identified. The reader may convey the topic from the title of the essay. The second paragraph, the first body paragraphs describing the details of a controlling idea, present another general background unrelated to the topic. The third and the fourth paragraphs unfortunately serve irrelevant statements, too. The introductory paragraph and the body of the essay do not have a focus and ideas in each paragraph do not match to each other. As a result, no related points are applicable and relevant for a summary stated in the concluding paragraph.

Concluding Paragraph

The criteria to evaluate a concluding paragraph refer to Kirzsner and Mandell (1978:106) and Oshima and Houge (1991:76). A concluding paragraph is a summary or review of the main points discussed in the body. The conclusion should focus reader's attention on the main points and hold that attention as effectively as the introduction does. Primarily, the conclusion should sum up, give readers a sense of completeness or finality, and perhaps help convince them. A common way of achieving these ends is to restate in other words the essay's controlling idea. Often this restatement appears in the first sentence of the conclusion.

Analysis of the concluding paragraphs of 10 English essays and 10 Indonesian essays obtained from the same subjects under study indicates that no paragraph meets the convention of closing in an academic essay. This part presents an analysis of closing paragraphs of a linear English essay (excerpt 9a) and a liner Indonesian essay (excerpt 9b). Analysis of non-linear English and Indonesian essays is based on excerpt (9c) and (9d).

In line with quotation 7a and quotation 8a, excerpt (9a) is clarified below. This excerpt is the closing part of a linear English essay, the introductory paragraph of which is presented in 7a and the body paragraphs are discussed in 8a.

9a. In conclusion, the thesis is a final subject that must be finished to reach under graduate of University. It is not the difficult one that must be faced. However, it can show the students ability in composing good writing. Of course, composing that thesis must be supported by many facilities beginning from counselor, fund, energy, literary books, etc. In the contrary, the students often get problems to accomplish it. (ING-3)

The main purpose of linking quotation 7a, 8a, and 9a is to evaluate how the introductory paragraph, the body paragraphs, and the concluding paragraph of an essay indicate a parallel development of ideas. Functioning as a concluding paragraph, excerpt 9a should present a summary or review of the main points discussed in the body paragraphs 8a, providing restatement in different words from the controlling ideas of the body paragraphs 8a.

To meet the criteria of a good concluding paragraph, excerpt 9a should clarify the thesis statement in 7a and provide the points of the detail in the body paragraphs 8a. Therefore, the thesis statement of the essay (i.e. Those difficulties are finding literary books, choosing a counselor, and developing English skill) should appear in 9a as a summary or a paraphrase, restating the thesis.

In fact, the concluding paragraph in 9a ends the essay with an information aside from the thesis and the controlling ideas. The concluding paragraph does not restate the thesis, nor it highlights points of the essay. Thus, the paragraph does not meet the criteria of a good concluding paragraph of an academic writing.

In the following discussion, characteristics of a concluding paragraph of a linear Indonesian essay are presented. The concluding paragraph of a linear Indonesian essay quoted in 9b presents the same characteristics of a concluding paragraph of a linear English essay quoted in 9a. Evaluation of the paragraph is based on the presence of the topic and controlling ideas in relation to the details in the body paragraphs, as well as a good convention of concluding paragraph of an academic writing.

- 9b. Beberapa langkah diatas mau tidak mau harus diupayakan keeksistentiannya sehingga akan terwujud sebuah proses pendidikan bahasa Inggris yang berkualitas dan berkompeten di bidangnya. (BIND-8)

The thesis of the essay is explicitly stated in the introductory paragraph as quoted in 7b and the controlling ideas are developed in the body paragraphs as seen in 8b. The thesis of this essay reads as English Department of MUM as a member of an academic society. This essay presents two points of controlling ideas: English Department of MUM should increase its academic quality and English Department of MUM should produce qualified graduates. As a good essay, the first controlling idea should be discussed in the first part of the body paragraphs and the second controlling idea in the next. The rest serves the concluding paragraph.

The essay, however, presents one additional paragraph in the body irrelevant to the topic and controlling ideas. Besides, the concluding paragraph also presents statements unrelated to the topic of the essay. As a result, the concluding paragraph is likely a comment than a restatement of the topic.

Excerpt 9c represents a concluding paragraph of a non-linear English essay. The excerpt is presented in reference to its introductory paragraph quoted in 7c and the whole essay in 8c. The title of this essay Students Problems in Writing English has let readers to expect more detailed information on problems of writing in English faced by students. What kind of writing (e.g. report, writing courses, thesis) is not defined in the title as it serves a broad topic. In addition, the introductory paragraph does not specify the topic and either, it does not sufficiently provide related information about the writing relevant to the title. An unclear statement that seems to be the topic and controlling ideas is revealed from the last sentence of the introductory paragraph stating "... many problems students have to write any kinds of paper in English, such as the lack of vocabulary, the ability in structuring English sentence, and the students ability in rearrange the English words...".

- 9c. *At last, we know that the thesis proposal is the difficult problem in composing thesis. Therefore, to overcome that problem the students must have good preparation by reads, or learn from the beginner thesis.* (ING-7)

Using the last sentence of the introductory paragraph as the topic and controlling ideas of the essay, the concluding paragraph in 9c is subject to clarify

the topic. However, the concluding paragraph ends the essay by providing a new comment to the content of the essay, deviating from the topic. As a result, the concluding paragraph does not represent an acceptable closing of a good academic writing.

In relation to the concluding paragraph of a non-linear Indonesian essay, excerpt 9d is exemplified. The introductory paragraph of 9d has been quoted in 7d based on an essay entitled: *Tantangan Lulusan Bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM di Pasaran Kerja*. The introductory paragraph does not announce the topic of the essay clearly. However, an indication is obtained from the title. The contents of the introductory paragraph do not support the title because the ideas jump from one point to a new different one.

9d. Dengan demikian bisa dikatakan bahwa sebenarnya tujuan Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang khususnya jurusan Bahasa Inggris untuk mencetak calon sarjana yang berkualitas di bidangnya bisa tercapai. Akan tetapi semua itu akan kembali lagi kepada manusianya. Pihak jurusan sudah memberikan beberapa pilihan bidang pekerjaan kepada mahasiswanya dan lulusannya bisa berkembang dan bersaing dibidang yang minatnya. (BIND-1)

The characteristics of the concluding paragraph in 9d evidently confirm the concluding paragraph of a non-linear English essay in 9b. Primarily, this concluding paragraph is developed in reference to a non-linear introductory paragraph that has no topic and no controlling ideas. One sentence in the supporting sentences of the introductory paragraph serves as a comment to another sentence. Since unclear and unfocused topic is defined, no conclusion should be achieved in the concluding paragraph ending the essay.

Coherence of the Essay

Description of coherence of the essays is directed to answer the question: How does the coherence of the English essays and Indonesian essays made by the same EFL undergraduate students of MUM indicate similarities and differences?

Coherence of an essay is analyzed by examining how ideas are linked and carried forward from one sentence to the next within any piece of writing (Latief, 1990:36). One of the four techniques or a combination of them to achieve coherence is used for evaluation. The four techniques are repeating key-nouns, using pronouns which refer back to the key nouns, using transition signals to

show how one idea is related to the next, and to arrange sentences in logical order, such as order by time, logical division, and order of importance (Oshima and Hogue, 1991:39). The focus of analysis on coherence in the essays is to examine the rhetorical patterns in the text. Intentionally, in this regard cohesion as part of analysis of text quality is not discussed. Cohesion is implicitly conceived to comment the essays.

The common problem with coherence of both linear and non-linear English essays in this study dealt with the inclusion of some sentences or ideas irrelevant to the major topic idea. Some used unnecessary general opening sentences irrelevant to the ideas as the background. See 10a for an example.

10a. In the last semester, all the university students should develop the thesis as one of the requirement to get the sarjana degree. Thesis in English Department is different with the other thesis in other department because it uses English as language mediator. Usually the students, in developing the thesis proposal, face many problems, such as facing the problems with the counselor, getting the related literature, and finding the place to be investigate. (ING-1a)

Other problems with coherence dealt with the incorrect use of two or three coherence signals appearing in one paragraph. Data on excerpt (10b) below indicate the use of incorrect key nouns, incorrect transition signals, and shift of pronouns. The text has developed the ideas coherently, but the cohesion is not fulfilled properly. The incorrect cohesion is present in the use of incorrect grammar (e.g. the counselors has; many seminar) and incorrect substitution (e.g. students into we).

10b. The counselors always has many reasons if there are many students who want to consultation. For example, they should join many seminar or they have another business. Sometimes, the counselor haven't correct the thesis though He promises to the students at the one time. In other words, in developing our thesis, we will get problems with the counselor. (ING-1b)

Excerpt 10c exemplifies the use of the awkward transition signals. Two kinds of transition signals are used in this paragraph: sentence connector introducing additional idea (e.g. besides) and sentence connectors introducing an effect (e.g. as a result). The sentence connectors are inappropriately used, so that the sentences in the paragraph do not smoothly relate to each other.

- 10c. Besides, stock of vocabularies might help the students do the exercise well. [As a result], they will enjoy writing word by word because of enough acquisition of vocabulary. ... Therefore, the students who apply and absorb it is too important. (ING-4a)

With regard to the Indonesian essays, problems with coherence indicated similar characteristics with coherence in English essays. The use of a general statement irrelevant to topics as the introductory sentences in a paragraph dominated the Indonesian essays. General statements accompanying topic in the linear Indonesian essay were clarified with the topic in the last sentence of the paragraph. Conversely, the non-linear Indonesian essays started the introductory sentences with general statements, ended the paragraph without a topic sentence, and put the last sentence in the general statement.

Citation 10d below shows how general statements irrelevant to the topic are stated in the first sentence of the paragraph. The student develops his topic beginning with very general facts stating a lot of number of undergraduate students in the job market. These statements require 5 sentences out of 7 sentences in the paragraph. The introductory sentences do not actually support and clarify the topic in the last sentence. Besides incoherent, incorrect cohesive devices in the text appear in terms of incorrect use of pronoun substitution (e.g. *para sarjana, ia, kita, dan dia*).

- 10d. *Pada saat ini dengan jumlah sarjana yang semakin banyak merupakan tantangan bagi para calon-calon sarjana. Karena pada saat ini titel kesarjanaan tidaklah menjamin bahwa ia akan laku di pasaran kerja. Teori yang dimiliki atau dipelajari selama ini akan sulit dimanfaatkan bila kita tidak memiliki ketrampilan khusus. Bagi lulusan bahasa Inggris ada beberapa hal yang menguntungkan bagi dia untuk terjun ke dunia luar kampus. Kemampuan bahasa Inggris merupakan salah satu jenis ketrampilan yang saat ini sangat dibutuhkan. Namun ada beberapa hal yang sangat perlu diperhatikan seperti persaingan di bidang pendidikan dengan lulusan IKIP, persaingan di bidang industri dengan lulusan akademi sekretaris atau yang lain dan persaingan di bidang sastra dan budaya dengan lulusan ABA.* (ING-10)

The progression of general sentences in a non-linear Indonesian essay is exemplified in the excerpt 10e. This text shows how the paragraph is opened in a general statement; controlling idea and details of the paragraph are developed using some general statements; and another general statement finalizes the paragraph.

10e. *Guru sebagai manusia dianugerahi rasa, cipta dan karsa, dimana disetiap langkah hidupnya selalu mengontrol dan dikontrol oleh akalunya. Sebagai pendidik dan pentransfer ilmu pengetahuan dan teknologi, guru harus benar-benar menguasai ilmu yang akan disampaikan, apalagi guru bahasa Inggris yang mentransfer ilmu-ilmu asing, tidak hanya menguasai ilmunya saja namun juga teknik penyampaian agar bisa diterima oleh penerima (murid). Kebudayaan asing yang sangat berbeda dengan budaya bangsa Indonesia memerlukan teknik tersendiri dalam pengajarannya. Sehingga guru sebagai mediator penyampai ilmu dan pengemban misi moralitas dapat berfungsi sebagaimana mestinya.* (BIND-6)

Coherence of the paragraph above is not achieved as a result of the jumping ideas in the whole paragraph. The above paragraph does not have a topic sentence and controlling ideas are not stated in the paragraph. Each sentence in the paragraph does not relate to each other, so that it does not read smoothly. As a result, no focus is obtained in the paragraph. However, the paragraph shows an acceptable cohesion as the cohesive devices, e.g. lexical and conjunction are correctly presented in the text.

In terms of the use of transition signals, some essays serve acceptable coherence and some provide incorrect uses. The linear Indonesian essay in both essay level and paragraph level devotes the acceptable transition signals. In addition, incorrect use of transition signals appears in most non-linear Indonesian essays in all levels: the essay and paragraphs. See 10f for the example.

10f. *Beberapa langkah yang perlu ditempuh antara lain: Pertama jurusan bahasa Inggris harus memberikan kurikulum pengajaran yang berbeda dari kurikulum bahasa Inggris yang selama ini ada di perguruan tinggi lain. Perbedaannya terletak pada penekanan aspek keinggrisannya dengan jalan menyajikan matakuliah Dasar Umum dengan bahasa Inggris. Sebagai contoh adalah mata kuliah Dasar-Dasar Psikologi, Dasar-Dasar Pendidikan, dan Ilmu Budaya dasar. Cara semacam ini dilakukan untuk memberikan nuansa akademis bahasa Inggris disamping untuk mengkaji khasanah ilmu pada setiap mata kuliah tersebut. Dengan demikian mahasiswa akan lebih terlibat dalam kondisi berbahasa Inggris.* (ING-8)

The underlined words of 10f indicate the correct use of transition signals. The student appropriately links the first sentence to the next and the last, using relevant words and phrases: “first, the difference, for example, this way, and in

short.” Similar to 10e cohesion in script 10f is achieved because of the correct use of substitution, conjunction, and paralellism.

In the paragraphs that follow, the student opens his paragraphs with the words: “second, third ...” and finally derives a phrase “in conclusion” in the concluding paragraph of the essay. However, the wrong use of pronouns occurred frequently in both linear and non-linear Indonesian essays. As seen in excerpt (10g), the incorrect use of pronoun substitution shifted the subjects of some sentences. For example, the phrase many teachers was substituted into he/she; many students for we, and graduate students of MUM for we.

- 10g. ... *Toh, sekarang ini banyak guru yang sudah membawa mobil sebagai “sikilnya”. Itu tergantung dari bagaimana usaha dia dengan cara yang baik, tentunya untuk mengubah image yang ada.* (BIND-7a)
- ... *Banyak mahasiswa yang menguasai bahasa Inggris secara lisan maupun tulisan dan itu berarti banyak saingan yang harus kita hadapi nantinya di pasaran kerja.* (BIND-9a)
- *Lulusan bahasa Inggris FKIP UMM dipersiapkan menjadi tenaga pendidik yang harus menjadi/siap di manapun kita dibutuhkan.* (BIND-9b)

CONCLUSIONS

The present study conceives the similarity and difference of rhetoric features in English and Indonesian essays. Similarity appears in the linearity and non-linearity of the essays, the development of ideas, and coherence quality. In line with the problems of the study, the following conclusions are drawn. First, similarity in linear English and Indonesian essays are present in a thesis and controlling ideas of the introductory paragraph and clarification of controlling ideas in the body paragraphs. Problems on linearity appear due to the addition of unrelated information in the body and the concluding paragraph that deviates from the topic. In the non-linear essays, thesis and controlling ideas are ignored, unrelated body paragraphs are shared, and digressive ideas are used. Evidently, students writing linear English essays do not necessarily write the same linear Indonesian essays.

Second, development of ideas in the linear and non-linear English and Indonesian essays is likely devoted to three stages of development: introduction, body paragraphs, and concluding paragraph. The layout structure of the essays meets the convention of academic writing. However, the discussion of the topic

in the whole essay is unfocused because ideas in each stage digress and they are unrelated to each other.

Third, Coherence is identified in straightforward sentences relevant to the topic and controlling ideas. However, the coherence in some English essays is interrupted with incorrect use of transition signals and sentence connectors. Conversely, most Indonesian essays use transition signals and sentence connectors properly.

The students writing linear English essays do not always share linear Indonesian essays. The rhetoric model is not yet a permanent intake for the students. When writing an English essay, the students attempt to follow linear model, and when writing an Indonesian essay they switch to the non-linear patterns that are appropriate to Indonesian culture.

Evidently, the subjects under study are in the process of changing rhetoric; some exhibit the straight linear, but most of them exemplify indirection. Variations occur in three-area (1) formulation of the title and the thesis statement, (2) development of introduction, and (3) development of the body paragraphs.

It appears that rhetorical differences may reflect the different writing conventions that are learned in a culture. As writing competence develops the same way competence in L2 increases, some organizational features of L1 writing appear in the writing of L2. The ability to use language in decontextualized situations comes to be learnable in any language and applied to any other language.

REFERENCES

- Arnaudent, M. and Barret, M.M. 1981. *Paragraph Development: A Guide for Students of English as a Second Language*. Rowly, Massachusetts: Prentice Hall, Inc.
- Connor, U. 1996. *Contrastive Rhetoric: Cross-Cultural Aspects of Second Language Writing*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Harjanto, I. 1999. *English Academic Writing Features by Indonesian Learners of English*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation. Malang: IKIP MALANG.
- Holsti, O.R. 1969. *Content Analysis for Social Sciences and Humanities*. Donn Mills, Ontario: Addison-Wesley Publishing.
- Kaplan, R.B. 1980. Cultural Thought Patterns in Intercultural Education. In Croft (Ed.) 1980. *Readings on English as a Second Language for Teachers and Teacher Trainees* (pp. 399-418). Boston: Little Brown and Co.

- Krippendorff, K. 1980. *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology*. London: Sage Publications.
- Latief, M.A. 1990. *Assessment of English Writing Skills for Students of English as a Second Language at IKIP MALANG Indonesia*. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation. Iowa City, Iowa: The University of Iowa.
- Miles, M. and Huberman, M. 1994. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Source book*. Beverly Hills: SAGE Publication Inc.
- Oshima, A. and Houge, A. 1991. *Writing Academic English: A Writing and Sentence Structure Handbook*. Second Edition. Cambridge: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.
- Sujoko. 1999. *Pola Pikir Kultural: Benarkah Orang Indonesia Berpikir Berputar-Putar?* Makalah Kongres Linguistik Nasional IX. Jakarta: Masyarakat Linguistik Indonesia, Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa, dan Unika Atma Jaya. pp. 40-42.
- Wahab, A. 1986. *Javanese Metaphors in Discourse Analysis*. Unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation. Champaign-Urbana: University of Illinois.
- Wahab, A. 1995a. *Linguistic Research on Discourse*. A paper presented at a one-day Seminar at Widya Mandala University, 23 September 1995.
- Wahab, A. 1995b. *Indonesian Rhetoric in Intercultural Communication*. The TEFLIN Silver Anniversary Seminar. Yogyakarta: IKIP Yogyakarta, Gajah Mada University, Sanata Dharma University, 2-5 August 1995.
- Wahab, A. 1995c. *Isu Linguistik: Pengajaran Bahasa dan Sastra*. Surabaya: Airlangga University Press.
- Wingersky, J., Boerner, H. B. 1992. *Writing Paragraphs and Essays: Integrating Reading, Writing, and Grammar Skills*. Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company.